

Statement for the decision on the defamation lawsuit to silence science
2019.3.26

Protecting the Lives We Can
Dr. Isamu Ishiwata

On March 8th 2018, the International Women's Day, we Protecting the Lives We Can published "The statement to protect the scientific speech which protects Japanese women's lives and health from cervical cancer".

As we mentioned in this statement, on March 16, 2016, Shuichi Ikeda, a former professor of Shinshu University appeared on TBS "News23" and said "Deposition of abnormal auto-antibody was observed only with the brain section of the mice vaccinated with the HPV vaccine. It seems to have damaged the function of Hippocamp (the area controls memory)"

"Apparently, the brain is damaged. It shows the objective findings common to the girls complaining of brain damage" and his presentation was broadcast nationwide. To this, a physician and journalist Riko Muranaka published the article "HPV vaccine drug-injury research group: falling evidence, debunked fabrication" on the monthly business magazine "Wedge" to criticize Ikeda's presentation, and it received a huge public support. But instead of defending himself at scientific journals or conferences, Ikeda brought it to the court.

Today, the decision was made by the Tokyo district court.

Here, we state our comments on this lawsuit and the decision.

1. This lawsuit is to replace the issue of science with defamation. We scientists and doctors in Protecting the Lives We Can can't dismiss such a conduct.
2. This lawsuit is to cover up and justify the scientific misconduct by making use of the legal system to silence science. We journalists and writers in Protecting the Lives We Can can't dismiss such a conduct.
3. There is no relation between the decision and the safety of the HPV vaccines. The safety of the HPV vaccines are established and confirmed. The WHO published the statement in this January, to name "vaccine hesitancy" as a top global threats, and announced especially to tackle elimination of the cervical cancer.

4. Regardless of the decision, the truth is only one. Ikeda's presentation was based on one-mouse (N=1) experiment, and the brain section of the mouse he presented on TBS "NEWS23" and the meeting of the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare was of the mouse "not vaccinated".
5. Ikeda's account of "a mouse vaccinated with the HPV vaccines" or "objective findings common to the girls complaining of brain damage" is the fact does not exist. It falls to the sense of "fabrication" in Kojien (the largest Japanese dictionary) and it is a fabrication in general sense as well.
6. In this lawsuit, Dr. Masashi Yanagisawa (Professor at Tsukuba University, the Nobel Prize candidate), Dr. Hiroyuki Yoshikawa (Director at Ibagaki Prefecture Central Hospital, studied under Dr. Harold Zur Hauzen, the Nobel Prize Winner for the invention of HPV vaccines), Dr. Kiichiro Noda (Former President of Kinki University, Dean of the School of Medicine) submitted an expert opinion to state Ikeda's conduct is called a fabrication in the scientific community, too.
7. Dr. Tasuku Honjo, the Nobel Prize winner in Medicine 2018 is a supporter of Protecting the Lives We Can, and has highly valued the article that Ikeda sued Dr. Muranaka for defamation.
8. Japanese were deceived by Ikeda's presentation. There are many who resent it, and there are many who made a wrong decision about the vaccination and lost a chance of protecting themselves from cervical cancer. We received 870 messages to criticize Ikeda's conduct including this legal attack and to support Dr. Muranaka.
9. The investigation committee of Shinshu University on Nov 15, 2016 criticized Ikeda for presenting preliminary evidence from one mouse as a conclusive research result to spread the scientifically incorrect message. They asked him to show the remorse, correct his comments, and reproducibility of the experiment but he has not shown any of them to date.
10. Japan's health ministry also criticized him, saying: "Dr Ikeda bears a large social responsibility for inviting public misunderstanding through his inappropriate announcement."
11. We Protecting the Lives We Can ask the media not to be misguided by the claims of Ikeda to use legal action to disseminate the fake science and fake news about the HPV vaccines, and to hide his scientific misconduct, but to deliver a correct message to the society. The media has a responsibility to evaluate and select the scientifically correct information, and to deliver a correct message to the society.